



Advertisement

OPINION

Tamir Rice prosecution claims ring hollow - new approaches needed: Terry H. Gilbert (Opinion)

Updated: Oct. 25, 2015, 3:42 p.m. | Published: Oct. 25, 2015, 2:42 p.m.

By Guest Columnist/cleveland.com

McGinty and Loomis butting heads over Cleveland police use of force

Cuyahoga County Prosecutor Timothy McGinty's inconsistencies and delays in Tamir Rice case have prompted calls for his recusal; perhaps he should be replaced by a special prosecutor, writes defense lawyer Terry H. Gilbert.

(Marvin Fong, The Plain Dealer, File, 2013)

The recent call by the editorial board of The Plain Dealer and Northeast Ohio Media Group for patience with Cuyahoga County Prosecutor Timothy McGinty's almost year-long inaction in presenting the Tamir Rice shooting death to a grand jury is disturbing, particularly in view of McGinty's irresponsible actions in releasing two expert reports suggesting the shooting was reasonable.

But the Northeast Ohio Media Group didn't stop there. It also ran a piece within days of the editorial, inviting criminal defense attorneys to suggest how extremely difficult it would be to prove that any crime was committed by the officers involved. If the intent was to preclude any fair determination of the evidence before a grand jury determination, the news organization might have succeeded with the help of McGinty, as the prospective jury pool is now likely contaminated by a biased narrative of the case.

The ultimate question -- why prosecuting cops for deadly force is met with reluctance -
- requires a journey into the heart of the criminal justice system.

First, there is a double standard when cops kill people. If a common citizen shoots a 12-year-old boy with a toy gun, she would be arrested immediately, and a grand jury would act within weeks with an indictment, likely for murder. Any self-defense claim would be resolved at a trial. But prosecutors, who work closely with police, hesitate to aggressively bring cops to justice.

Second, the language of the law is inadequate when prosecuting police. In the recent prosecution of Cleveland police officer Michael Brelo, who was acquitted by a judge, not a jury, the judge used an "objectively reasonable" standard to clear Brelo's actions in shooting 49 bullets into the bodies of Melissa Williams and Timothy Russell as they sat, unarmed, in a vehicle. Many people thought his conduct warranted murder or at least manslaughter. Yet Brelo walked free, in part, because he was afforded a legal standard which only applies to police, not anyone else who might use force. We need a state civil rights criminal statute (similar to the federal law) designed to deal with police who cross the line and violate the constitutional rights of citizens.

Third, the grand jury itself is a wounded and outdated institution, created by good intentions more than 200 years ago, but now an affront to justice on many levels. To an average citizen, particularly people of color, the grand jury is a secret and repressive body, a tool of the police and prosecutors to ram through over-charged indictments which force plea bargains for those too poor or too afraid to risk a trial where the deck is stacked. But the adverse is true for police who are afforded preferential deference, caution, and exhaustive reviews, and likely no input from a prosecutor to urge a vote in favor of an indictment.

To be sure, McGinty has created for himself a public relations nightmare with calls for his recusal from the Rice case. But it's his own fault because of his erratic and inconsistent approaches to police cases.

In the Kenny Smith case -- where a federal jury recently awarded \$5.5 million for the unconstitutional use of deadly force against a 20-year-old victim -- McGinty had earlier called the cop's actions heroic, after not allowing the grand jury to vote on whether to issue an indictment. Now, after the federal verdict, he has been forced to refer the case to the Sheriff's Department for a re-investigation.

Clearly, patience is not what we need, but systemic reform. In the meantime, replacing McGinty with a special prosecutor might be a good idea, and would restore some confidence to the Tamir Rice family.

Terry H. Gilbert, a partner with the law firm of Friedman and Gilbert, specializes in civil rights and criminal defense litigation and represented the family of Kenneth Smith in its recent federal court case.

If you purchase a product or register for an account through one of the links on our site, we may receive compensation.



▼ More on Cleveland.com

[Sponsor Content](#)

[Sell your car](#)

[Post a job](#)

[Sitemap & search](#)

[Post a classified ad](#)

[Sell/rent your home](#)

[Weather](#)

[Videos](#)

[Archives](#)

▼ Follow Us

[Twitter](#)

[Pinterest](#)

[Facebook](#)

[Instagram](#)

[RSS](#)

▼ Cleveland.com Sections

[News](#)

[Sports](#)

[Entertainment](#)

[Politics](#)

[Opinion](#)

[Living](#)

[Betting](#)

[Rentals](#)

[Obituaries](#)

[Jobs](#)

[Deals in Your Area](#)

[Classifieds](#)

[Autos](#)

[Real Estate](#)

▼ Mobile

[Mobile Apps](#)

▼ Your Regional News Pages

[Lakewood](#)

[Beachwood](#)

[Brunswick](#)

[Strongsville](#)

[Parma & Parma Heights](#)

[More Communities](#)

▼ About Us

[Advertise with us](#)

[About Cleveland.com](#)

[About Advance Ohio](#)

[Contact Us](#)

[Career Opportunities](#)

[Delivery Opportunities](#)

[Audience FAQ](#)

▼ Subscriptions

[cleveland.com](#)

[The Plain Dealer](#)

[Newsletters](#)

[Sun News](#)

▼ Already a Subscriber

[Make a Payment](#)

[Manage your Subscription](#)

[Place a Vacation Hold](#)

[Delivery Feedback](#)

ADVANCELOCAL

Use of and/or registration on any portion of this site constitutes acceptance of our [User Agreement](#) (updated 4/4/2023), [Privacy Policy and Cookie Statement](#), and [Your Privacy Choices and Rights](#) (updated 1/26/2023).


[Cookies Settings](#)

© 2023 Advance Local Media LLC. All rights reserved ([About Us](#)).

The material on this site may not be reproduced, distributed, transmitted, cached or otherwise used, except with the prior written permission of Advance Local.

Community Rules apply to all content you upload or otherwise submit to this site.

YouTube's privacy policy is available [here](#) and YouTube's terms of service is available [here](#).

 [Ad Choices](#)